

# **Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking**

## **Summary of Public Comment**



**May 31, 2002**



**Content Analysis Team**  
**801-517-1020**

*The policy of the United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) prohibits discrimination on the basis of race, color, national origin, age, religion, sex, disability, familial status, or political affiliation. Persons believing they have been discriminated against in any Forest Service related activity should write to: Chief, Forest Service, USDA, P.O. Box 96090, Washington, DC 20090-6090*

# Table of Contents

<b>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</b>	<b>I</b>
INTRODUCTION .....	I
CONTENT ANALYSIS PROCESS.....	I
PROJECT BACKGROUND AND DOCUMENT OVERVIEW .....	I
GENERAL OVERVIEW OF PUBLIC COMMENT .....	IV
PROMINENT THEMES IN PUBLIC COMMENT.....	VI
Trust and Integrity .....	vi
Process, Planning, Policies, and Laws.....	vi
<i>National Forest Management Act</i> .....	vi
<i>National Environmental Policy Act</i> .....	vii
<i>Interim Direction</i> .....	vii
<i>Other Policy Concerns</i> .....	vii
<i>Appeals and Litigation</i> .....	viii
<i>Other Legal Concerns</i> .....	viii
Public Involvement .....	ix
<i>Informed Decisionmaking</i> (Question 1).....	ix
<i>Working Together</i> (Question 2).....	x
<i>Competing Values/Limited Resources</i> (Question 9) .....	xii
Roadless Area Values (Question 6).....	xii
<i>Characteristics of Roadless Areas</i> .....	xii
<i>Environmental Values</i> .....	xiii
<i>Social Environment and Values</i> .....	xiv
<i>Economic Environment and Values</i> .....	xiv
Forest Management .....	xvi
<i>Activities</i> (Question 7) .....	xvi
<i>Designating Areas</i> (Question 8).....	xviii
Protecting Forests, Communities, and Private Property Access .....	xix
<i>Protecting Forests</i> (Question 3) .....	xix
<i>Protecting Communities</i> (Question 4) .....	xx
<i>Protecting Access to Property</i> (Question 5).....	xxi
CONCLUSION.....	XXI
 <b>CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION TO NATIONAL ROADLESS PROTECTION RULEMAKING</b>	 <b>1-1</b>
NATIONAL ROADLESS PROTECTION – GENERAL REMARKS.....	1-1
Need for a National Roadless Rule General .....	1-1
<i>Develop a National Roadless Rule</i> .....	1-2
<i>Do Not Develop a National Roadless Rule</i> .....	1-4
Need for the Roadless Area Conservation Rule.....	1-5
<i>Need for the Roadless Area Conservation Rule General</i> .....	1-7
<i>Implement the Roadless Area Conservation Rule</i> .....	1-8
<i>Do Not Implement the Roadless Area Conservation Rule</i> .....	1-18



*Clean Water Act*..... 2-52  
*Conservation and Reinvestment Act*..... 2-53  
*Enabling Act*..... 2-54  
*Endangered Species Act*..... 2-54  
*Federal Advisory Committee Act*..... 2-58  
*Forest and Rangeland Renewable Resource Planning Act* ..... 2-59  
*Knutson-Vandenberg Act*..... 2-59  
*Mining Laws General* ..... 2-60  
*Mining Law of 1872*..... 2-65  
*Mining and Mineral Policy Act*..... 2-66  
*Multiple Use and Sustained Yield Act* ..... 2-67  
*National Forest Protection and Restoration Act* ..... 2-68  
*Northern Rockies Ecosystem Protection Act*..... 2-69  
*Organic Act*..... 2-69  
*Regulatory Flexibility Act*..... 2-70  
*Revised Statute 2477*..... 2-72  
*Tongass Timber Reform Act*..... 2-74  
*Weeks Act*..... 2-76  
*Wild Horse Act* ..... 2-76  
*Wilderness Acts* ..... 2-76  
*Executive Orders* ..... 2-78  
*Other*..... 2-80

**CHAPTER 3 PUBLIC INVOLVEMENT 3-1**

INFORMED DECISIONMAKING (*QUESTION 1*)..... 3-1  
 Informed Decisionmaking General ..... 3-1  
 Decisionmaking Authority ..... 3-4  
     *The Forest Service*..... 3-5  
     *The Legislative Branch*..... 3-9  
     *State, County, and City Governments*..... 3-11  
     *Other*..... 3-12  
     *Trust and Integrity*..... 3-13  
 Local vs. National Decisionmaking..... 3-20  
     *Local vs. National Decisionmaking General*..... 3-21  
     *Local (Forest Level) Decisionmaking* ..... 3-21  
     *Local (Forest Level) Decisionmaking with National Guidance* ..... 3-30  
     *National Decisionmaking*..... 3-33  
 The Forest Planning Process ..... 3-39  
     *The Forest Planning Process General*..... 3-40  
     *The Forest Planning Process – Development/Implementation of Forest Plans*..... 3-43  
     *The Forest Planning Process – Public Participation* ..... 3-44  
     *The Forest Planning Process – Its Appropriate Role* ..... 3-46  
 WORKING TOGETHER (*QUESTION 2*)..... 3-53  
     Adequacy of Public Involvement Processes/Methods ..... 3-53  
         *Adequacy of Public Involvement Processes/Methods General*..... 3-55

*Adequacy/Availability of Information* ..... 3-60  
*Adequacy of Public Meetings*..... 3-63  
*Adequacy of Comment Period*..... 3-66  
*Adequacy of Timeframe*..... 3-68  
*Use of Science/Best Information Available* ..... 3-69  
*Adequacy of Public Comment*..... 3-74  
*Analysis of Public Comment* ..... 3-77  
*Scope of Public Comment to be Considered* ..... 3-79  
*Consideration of Public Comment* ..... 3-81  
*Response to Public Comment* ..... 3-88  
*Other*..... 3-89  
Public Involvement in Decisionmaking ..... 3-89  
    *Public Involvement in Decisionmaking General*..... 3-91  
    *The Role of the General Public*..... 3-94  
    *The Role of Local/Rural Residents* ..... 3-94  
    *The Role of Special Interest Groups*..... 3-95  
    *Collaboration Processes*..... 3-100  
    *Collaboration with State and Local Governments* ..... 3-104  
    *Collaboration with Agencies*..... 3-108  
    *Collaboration with Other Groups*..... 3-109  
    *Education*..... 3-110  
    *Volunteerism*..... 3-112  
American Indian Rights and Interests ..... 3-113  
    *Comments from Other Respondents Regarding American Indian Tribal Interests*..... 3-117  
COMPETING VALUES/LIMITED RESOURCES (QUESTION 9) ..... 3-122  
    Managing Competing Interests ..... 3-122  
        *Managing Competing Interests General* ..... 3-123  
        *Administrative/Agency Guidance* ..... 3-131  
        *Local Forest Planning Process* ..... 3-132  
        *Enhanced Collaborative Efforts* ..... 3-133  
        *Public Education/Information Efforts*..... 3-136  
        *Forest Service Staff Training/Education* ..... 3-137  
        *Will of the Public/Elected Representatives* ..... 3-138  
        *Ecosystem/Preservation Values* ..... 3-141

**CHAPTER 4 ROADLESS AREA VALUES (QUESTION 6) 4-1**

CHARACTERISTICS OF ROADLESS AREAS ..... 4-1  
    Characteristics of Roadless Areas General ..... 4-1  
        *Evaluation of Roadless Areas*..... 4-2  
        *Adequacy of Analysis* ..... 4-9  
    Adequacy of Maps and Inventories ..... 4-10  
        *Maps General* ..... 4-11  
        *Accuracy of Maps* ..... 4-15  
        *Inventories General* ..... 4-20  
        *Accuracy of Inventories* ..... 4-23

Definitions .....	4-30
ENVIRONMENTAL VALUES.....	4-36
Environmental Values General.....	4-36
<i>Environmental Values General – Roadless Areas</i> .....	4-40
<i>Adequacy of Analysis</i> .....	4-44
<i>Funding</i> .....	4-47
<i>Education</i> .....	4-48
Evaluation of Roadless Areas .....	4-50
Management .....	4-52
<i>Management General</i> .....	4-53
<i>Ecosystem/Restoration Management</i> .....	4-55
<i>Multiple Use Management</i> .....	4-59
<i>Allow Multiple Use Management</i> .....	4-60
<i>Do Not Allow/Reconsider Multiple Use Management</i> .....	4-62
<i>Other Management Philosophies</i> .....	4-63
<i>Effects of Activities/Disturbance on the Environment</i> .....	4-64
<i>Positive Effects</i> .....	4-66
<i>Negative Effects</i> .....	4-69
Water Quality.....	4-71
<i>Water Quality General</i> .....	4-72
<i>Watershed Health</i> .....	4-74
<i>Water Quantity</i> .....	4-77
Air Quality.....	4-78
<i>Air Quality General</i> .....	4-79
<i>Adequacy of Analysis</i> .....	4-80
<i>Effects of Activities/Disturbance on Air Quality</i> .....	4-81
Soils .....	4-82
<i>Soils General</i> .....	4-83
<i>Adequacy of Analysis</i> .....	4-83
<i>Effects of Activities/Disturbance on Soils</i> .....	4-83
Scenery .....	4-84
Wildlife.....	4-84
<i>Wildlife General</i> .....	4-86
<i>Wildlife General – Species-Specific Considerations</i> .....	4-91
<i>Funding</i> .....	4-92
<i>Effects of Activities/Disturbance on Wildlife</i> .....	4-93
<i>Positive Effects</i> .....	4-95
<i>Negative Effects</i> .....	4-96
Wildlife Habitat .....	4-100
<i>Wildlife Habitat General</i> .....	4-101
<i>Effects of Activities/Disturbance on Wildlife Habitat</i> .....	4-108
<i>Positive Effects</i> .....	4-108
<i>Negative Effects</i> .....	4-109
Threatened and Endangered Species.....	4-111
<i>Threatened and Endangered Species General</i> .....	4-111
<i>Effects of Activities/Disturbance on Threatened and Endangered Species</i> . 4-114	

<i>Positive Effects</i> .....	4-115
<i>Negative Effects</i> .....	4-115
Vegetation and Botanical Resources .....	4-116
<i>Vegetation and Botanical Resources General</i> .....	4-116
<i>Vegetation and Botanical Resources – Species Specific Considerations</i> ....	4-121
<i>Effects of Activities/Disturbance on Vegetation and Botanical Resources</i> ...	4-122
<i>Positive Effects</i> .....	4-122
<i>Negative Effects</i> .....	4-123
SOCIAL ENVIRONMENT AND VALUES.....	4-124
Social Values of Roadless Areas .....	4-124
<i>Social Values of Roadless Areas General</i> .....	4-126
<i>Bequest Values</i> .....	4-139
<i>Educational Values</i> .....	4-140
<i>Access for Special Populations</i> .....	4-141
<i>Health and Wellness Values</i> .....	4-145
<i>Noise</i> .....	4-147
Adequacy of Analysis.....	4-148
ECONOMIC ENVIRONMENT AND VALUES .....	4-149
Economic Environment and Values General.....	4-149
Economic Evaluation of Roadless Areas .....	4-150
<i>Comparative Costs and Benefits of Ecosystem Protection and Resource</i>	
<i>Extraction</i> .....	4-154
Adequacy of Analysis.....	4-158
<i>Adequacy of Analysis General</i> .....	4-159
<i>Adequacy of Analysis – Economic Effects of a National Roadless Rule</i> .....	4-165
<i>Analysis of Analysis – the Roadless Area Conservation Rule EIS</i> .....	4-167
Economic Effects .....	4-168
<i>General Effects on Local Communities and Economies</i> .....	4-171
<i>Effects on Resource Dependent Communities and the Timber Industry</i> ....	4-173
<i>Effects on the Agricultural and Ranching Sector</i> .....	4-178
<i>Effects on the Mining, Oil, and Gas Industries</i> .....	4-179
<i>Effects on the Recreation Sector</i> .....	4-183
<i>Effects on Employment</i> .....	4-188
<i>Effects on Tax Receipts/Funding to Communities</i> .....	4-194
<i>Impacts on the Global Economy</i> .....	4-198
User Fees .....	4-201
Subsidies and Agency Expenditures.....	4-203
HERITAGE RESOURCES.....	4-213
Heritage Resources General.....	4-213
<b>CHAPTER 5 FOREST MANAGEMENT</b> .....	<b>5-1</b>
FOREST MANAGEMENT .....	5-1
Forest Management General .....	5-1
Adequacy of Analysis.....	5-5
Roadless Areas Management General .....	5-7
<i>Authority for Roadless Area Management</i> .....	5-8

<i>General Direction of Roadless Area Management</i> .....	5-10
ACTIVITIES (QUESTION 7) .....	5-12
Activities General .....	5-12
<i>Activity Management General</i> .....	5-13
<i>Adequacy of Analysis</i> .....	5-14
<i>Allow Activities</i> .....	5-14
<i>Do Not Allow/Restrict Activities</i> .....	5-17
Travel Management General.....	5-18
Access .....	5-19
<i>Adequacy of Analysis</i> .....	5-21
Funding.....	5-24
Travelways.....	5-25
Roads.....	5-26
Trails .....	5-28
Road/Trail Construction.....	5-29
<i>Road/Trail Construction General</i> .....	5-31
Funding.....	5-31
Road Construction .....	5-32
<i>Allow Road Construction</i> .....	5-33
<i>Do Not Allow/Restrict Road Construction</i> .....	5-36
<i>Allow Trail Construction</i> .....	5-40
Road/Trail Maintenance/Reconstruction .....	5-41
<i>Road/Trail Maintenance/Reconstruction General</i> .....	5-42
Funding.....	5-42
Road Maintenance/Reconstruction .....	5-44
<i>Allow Road Maintenance/Reconstruction</i> .....	5-45
<i>Allow Trail Maintenance/Reconstruction</i> .....	5-46
Road/Trail Closure/Obliteration/Restoration .....	5-46
<i>Road/Trail Closure/Obliteration/Restoration General</i> .....	5-47
Funding.....	5-48
Road Closure/Obliteration/Restoration.....	5-48
<i>Allow Road Closure/Obliteration/Restoration</i> .....	5-50
<i>Do Not Allow/Restrict Road Closure/Obliteration/Restoration</i> .....	5-51
Natural Resources General.....	5-52
<i>Natural Resources Management General</i> .....	5-53
<i>Adequacy of Analysis</i> .....	5-59
Funding.....	5-60
<i>Allow Active Natural Resource Management</i> .....	5-60
<i>Do Not Allow/Restrict Active Natural Resource Management</i> .....	5-61
Timber Removal .....	5-64
<i>Timber Removal General</i> .....	5-66
<i>Adequacy of Analysis</i> .....	5-69
Funding.....	5-69
<i>Allow Timber Removal</i> .....	5-70
<i>Do Not Allow/Restrict Timber Removal</i> .....	5-77
Mining, Oil, and Gas Development.....	5-79

<i>Mining, Oil, and Gas Development General</i> .....	5-81
<i>Adequacy of Analysis</i> .....	5-84
<i>Allow Mining, Oil, and Gas Development</i> .....	5-89
<i>Do Not Allow/Restrict Mining, Oil, and Gas Development</i> .....	5-96
Grazing .....	5-99
<i>Grazing General</i> .....	5-100
<i>Funding</i> .....	5-101
<i>Allow Grazing</i> .....	5-101
<i>Do Not Allow/Restrict Grazing</i> .....	5-102
Utility Corridors .....	5-102
<i>Utilities General</i> .....	5-103
<i>Allow Utilities</i> .....	5-103
<i>Do Not Allow/Restrict Utilities</i> .....	5-105
Other Natural Resource Concerns .....	5-106
Recreation General .....	5-108
<i>Recreation Management General</i> .....	5-109
<i>Adequacy of Analysis</i> .....	5-113
<i>Funding</i> .....	5-113
<i>Recreation Access</i> .....	5-114
<i>User Conflicts</i> .....	5-116
Motorized Recreation .....	5-119
<i>Motorized Recreation General</i> .....	5-120
<i>Adequacy of Analysis</i> .....	5-121
<i>Education</i> .....	5-121
<i>Cumulative Impacts on Motorized Recreationists</i> .....	5-122
<i>Allow Motorized Recreation</i> .....	5-125
<i>Do Not Allow/Restrict Motorized Recreation</i> .....	5-128
<i>Other</i> .....	5-130
Motorized Recreation – Off-Road Vehicles .....	5-130
<i>Off-Road Vehicles General</i> .....	5-131
<i>Funding</i> .....	5-131
<i>Allow Off-Road Vehicles</i> .....	5-132
<i>Do Not Allow/Restrict Off-Road Vehicles</i> .....	5-132
Motorized Recreation – Snowmobiles.....	5-133
<i>Adequacy of Analysis</i> .....	5-133
<i>Allow Snowmobiles</i> .....	5-133
<i>Do Not Allow/Restrict Snowmobiles</i> .....	5-134
Non-Motorized Recreation .....	5-134
<i>Non-motorized Recreation General</i> .....	5-135
<i>Allow Non-motorized Recreation</i> .....	5-135
<i>Do Not Allow/Restrict Non-motorized Recreation</i> .....	5-136
Mechanized Recreation .....	5-136
<i>Allow Mechanized Recreation</i> .....	5-137
<i>Do Not Allow/Restrict Mechanized Recreation</i> .....	5-137
Ski Area Development .....	5-138
<i>Ski Area Development General</i> .....	5-138

<i>Allow Ski Area Development</i> .....	5-139
<i>Do Not Allow/Restrict Ski Area Development</i> .....	5-143
Hunting and Fishing .....	5-144
<i>Hunting and Fishing General</i> .....	5-145
<i>Funding</i> .....	5-147
<i>Allow Hunting and Fishing</i> .....	5-147
<i>Do Not Allow/Restrict Hunting and Fishing</i> .....	5-149
Outfitter-Guides .....	5-151
<i>Allow Outfitter-Guides</i> .....	5-151
<i>Do Not Allow/Restrict Outfitter-Guides</i> .....	5-152
Equestrian Use.....	5-152
<i>Allow Equestrian Use</i> .....	5-152
<i>Do Not Allow/Restrict Equestrian Use</i> .....	5-153
Camping/Shelters/Accommodations/etc.....	5-153
<i>Camping/Shelters/Accommodations/etc. General</i> .....	5-154
<i>Allow Camping/Shelters/Accommodations/etc.</i> .....	5-154
<i>Do Not Allow/Restrict Camping/Shelters/Accommodations/etc.</i> .....	5-155
Special Use Permits .....	5-155
Other Recreation Concerns.....	5-156
DESIGNATING AREAS (QUESTION 8) .....	5-157
Designating Management Categories General .....	5-157
Wilderness Recommendations.....	5-162
<i>Wilderness Recommendations General</i> .....	5-163
<i>Do Recommend Roadless Areas for Wilderness Designation</i> .....	5-166
<i>Do Not Recommend Roadless Areas for Wilderness Designation</i> .....	5-171
<i>Wilderness Recommendation Criteria</i> .....	5-174
<i>Management of Roadless Areas That Do Not Meet Wilderness Criteria</i> ....	5-178
<i>Relationship of Roadless and Wilderness Management</i> .....	5-179
Roadless Designation .....	5-183
<i>Roadless Designation General</i> .....	5-186
<i>Adequacy of Analysis</i> .....	5-190
<i>Do Designate Roadless Areas</i> .....	5-191
<i>Do Not Designate Roadless Areas</i> .....	5-196
<i>Roadless Area Designation Criteria</i> .....	5-198
Inclusion/Exclusion of Specific Areas from a National Roadless Rule.....	5-212
<i>Inclusion</i> .....	5-213
<i>Exclusion</i> .....	5-231
Use of Existing Forest Plan Designations .....	5-246
Other New Management Categories .....	5-248
AGENCY ORGANIZATION AND FUNDING .....	5-251
Agency Organization .....	5-251
<i>Agency Organization General</i> .....	5-251
<i>Forest Service Personnel/Training</i> .....	5-252
Agency Funding .....	5-256
<i>Agency Funding General</i> .....	5-256
<i>Funding Sources</i> .....	5-257

*Funding Priorities*..... 5-258  
*Financial Accountability* ..... 5-259  
 Monitoring/Enforcement..... 5-260

**CHAPTER 6 PROTECTING FORESTS, COMMUNITIES, AND PROPERTY ACCESS 6-1**

PROTECTING FORESTS (*QUESTION 3*) ..... 6-1  
 Natural Disturbance Processes and Forest Health General..... 6-1  
     *Forest Health Management General*..... 6-3  
     *Forest Health Management General – Management Strategies*..... 6-5  
     *Forest Health Management General – Public Involvement*..... 6-7  
     *Forest Health Management General – Roadless Areas* ..... 6-8  
     *Adequacy of Analysis* ..... 6-13  
     *Adequacy of Analysis – Concepts* ..... 6-17  
     *Funding*..... 6-19  
     *Active Management*..... 6-20  
     *Ecosystem/Restoration Management* ..... 6-23  
     *Ecosystem/Restoration Management – Roadless Areas*..... 6-25  
     *Management Exceptions* ..... 6-30  
 Roads/Access – Forest Health Management..... 6-33  
     *Roads/Access General* ..... 6-33  
     *Funding*..... 6-33  
     *Allow Roads/Access* ..... 6-34  
     *Do not Allow Roads/Access*..... 6-40  
 Timber Removal..... 6-46  
     *Timber Harvest General* ..... 6-47  
     *Adequacy of Analysis* ..... 6-47  
     *Funding*..... 6-48  
     *Allow Timber Removal*..... 6-49  
     *Do Not Allow/Restrict Timber Removal*..... 6-59  
 Fire Management..... 6-63  
     *Fire Management General*..... 6-65  
     *Fire Management General – Management Strategies* ..... 6-67  
     *Adequacy of Analysis* ..... 6-70  
     *Adequacy of Analysis – Management Strategies*..... 6-75  
     *Funding*..... 6-79  
     *Education*..... 6-83  
     *Active Management*..... 6-84  
     *Ecosystem/Restoration Management* ..... 6-94  
     *Other*..... 6-99  
 Insects, Disease, and Noxious Plants..... 6-99  
     *Insects, Disease, and Noxious Plants General*..... 6-100  
     *Adequacy of Analysis* ..... 6-101  
     *Funding*..... 6-104  
     *Active Management*..... 6-105  
     *Ecosystem/Restoration Management*..... 6-109

PROTECTING COMMUNITIES (QUESTION 4).....	6-115
Private Property Protection .....	6-115
<i>Private Property Protection General</i> .....	6-118
<i>Adequacy of Analysis</i> .....	6-119
<i>Management</i> .....	6-119
<i>Land Use Ordinances/Building Codes</i> .....	6-122
<i>Urban-Forest Interface</i> .....	6-123
<i>Urban-Forest Interface – Funding</i> .....	6-126
<i>Public Collaboration</i> .....	6-126
Responsibility for Protecting Private Property .....	6-127
<i>Responsibility of the Forest Service</i> .....	6-128
<i>Responsibility of Private Property Owners</i> .....	6-134
<i>Financial Responsibility</i> .....	6-135
<i>Other</i> .....	6-137
PROTECTING ACCESS TO PROPERTY (QUESTION 5).....	6-138
Protecting Access to Property General .....	6-138
<i>Roadless Area Management</i> .....	6-141
Access to National Forest System Lands Through Private Property .....	6-143
Maintenance of Routes through National Forest System Lands to Private Property.....	6-144
<i>Road Construction/Maintenance</i> .....	6-152
<i>Road Construction/Maintenance – Funding</i> .....	6-153
Legal Considerations.....	6-153
Land Exchanges/Purchases.....	6-156
<i>Land Exchanges/Purchases General</i> .....	6-157
<i>Land Exchanges</i> .....	6-157
<i>Purchases</i> .....	6-159
<b>APPENDIX A CONTENT ANALYSIS PROCESS</b>	<b>A-1</b>
<b>APPENDIX B CODING STRUCTURE</b>	<b>B-1</b>
<b>APPENDIX C PUBLIC CONCERN LIST</b>	<b>C-1</b>
<b>APPENDIX D DEMOGRAPHICS</b>	<b>D-1</b>
<b>APPENDIX E ORGANIZED RESPONSE REPORT</b>	<b>E-1</b>
<b>APPENDIX F SITE-SPECIFIC REQUESTS FOR INCLUSION/EXEMPTION</b>	<b>F-1</b>
<b>APPENDIX G LIST OF PREPARERS</b>	<b>G-1</b>

